

## ***Evaluation of Grade Ten Civics and Ethical Education Textbook vis-à-vis the Representation of Dimensions of Ethnicity, Nationality, Religion, and Economic Levels***

Aschale Tadege Emiru\* and Solomon Melesse Mengistie\*\*

\* Assistant professor at the Department of Education, Institute of Educational and Behavioral Science, Debre Markos University, Ethiopia.

*aschaletadege@gmail.com, https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5808-146X*

\*\* Professor at the College of Education and Behavioral Sciences, Bahir Dar University, Ethiopia. *solomonmelessebdu@gmail.com, https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0565-4321*

**Abstract:** The main purpose of this article is to examine the representation of some dimensions of ethnicity, nationality, religion, and economics in grade 10 civics and ethical education textbook, which was published in 2002 E.C and revised in 2004 E.C. The study used analysis is civic and ethical education textbook of grade-10 using content analysis as a research method. Data were primarily collected using qualitative procedures, with additional quantitative data derived from frequency counts of pictures. The quantitative figure indicates that the Ethiopian nationality is given a more significant place over ethnic nationality. The economic level is adequately represented in the pictures, ranking second from the total pictures in the textbook. On the other hand, religious issues have been given an insignificant place. They are entertained in the curriculum without giving much attention to their deeper meanings. Even though the quantitative figure shows that more coverage is given to Ethiopian nationality, the qualitative analysis suggests a tendency to encourage students to have strong feelings about ethnic values and underscore ethnic identity as the core value for human beings. The issue of economic level is demonstrated directly and indirectly through integration with different cardinal ethical values discussed in the textbook. Overall, the textbook's attempt to represent ethnicity, nationality, religion, and economic levels positively impacts social climate change and nation-building. However, further efforts are needed to improve the curriculum to address current social challenges better.

**Keywords:** Ethnicity, Nationality, Religion, Economic Levels, Civic and Ethical Education, Textbook Evaluation

## Introduction

Ethiopia is home to a multitude of ethnicities, religions, and different cultures. The country has experienced challenges in managing its diversity. Hence, several political formations have been taking place. The post-1991 transformation into a federal state has put religion, ethnicities, and the nature of the federal state into confrontation (Karlo, 2013). It has always been the demand of any society to make its members more moral, tolerant, and respectful to live together in harmony. In this modern era, social solidarity is highly demanded and is deeply promoted through collaborative efforts among the concerned bodies. One of the possible ways is to provide civics and ethical education in schools.

The present government has introduced civic and ethical education to be offered at all grade levels. However, different local studies conducted have shown that this subject failed to bring the required civic and ethical behavior (Dawit & Haftu, 2012; Mulualem et al., 2017; Mulugeta et al., 2011). Mulugeta et al. (2011) conducted a study on the effectiveness of civics and ethical education with a focus on primary and secondary schools in East Gojjam and concluded that it did not produce the desirable moral character. These researchers used a mixed method design and investigated the associated factors, like lack of professional competencies on the part of teachers of the subject; absence of a conducive school environment to realize the missions of the subject; lack of resources to teach the subject inside and outside the classroom; lack of support from other subject teachers; and presence of real-world-practices opposite to the values learned in schools. Still, this study did not address the contents of the textbook.

The qualitative case study conducted by Mulualem et al (2017) on the implementation of a single primary school revealed that the subject did not bring the desired change on the part of students. According to this finding, students were observed to exercise their rights while ignoring their obligations. The reasons, according to their study,

were a lack of coordination among parents and teachers of other academic subjects. Beyond problems of coordination among some stakeholders, this study did not clearly show the contribution of the textbook.

Dawit and Haftu (2012) also conducted a study on civics and ethical education endeavors exerted in the course of shaping identities and eventually drew that such an effort is more likely to deepen students' ethnic identity than their national common identity. A qualitative study examining the role of Civics and Ethical Education, as well as Social Studies textbooks in primary schools, found that ethnic identity is more frequently and strongly emphasized than national identity. However, this study focused solely on the ethnic and national dimensions of the textbooks, without addressing religious or economic aspects. Additionally, the study was conducted only at the primary school level.

Along with others, the researchers believe that analyzing textbooks is highly important to have a clear picture of the civics and ethical education system. All school subjects and textbooks should be designed and taught from diverse multicultural perspectives (Solomon, 2015). Civics and ethical education textbooks are useful sources for understanding and developing identity in multiethnic countries like Ethiopia (Dawit & Haftu, 2012; Solomon, 2015). It is important to evaluate a textbook for its effectiveness in addressing educational goals as well as specific course objectives (Gachukia & Chung, 2005). Thus, the main purpose of the study is to examine the representation of some dimensions of ethnicity, nationality, religion, and economics in the civics and ethical education textbook of grade 10 by raising the following guiding questions:

- To what extent ethnicities, nationalities, religions, and economic issues in Ethiopia are represented in the textbook?
- How are the issues of ethnicities, nationalities, religions, and economics in Ethiopia demonstrated in the textbook?

## **Theoretical Framework**

A textbook serves as the fundamental teaching material to achieve the educational objectives and knowledge standards defined in the curriculum and the catalog of knowledge (Mithans & Grmek, 2020). According to Mithans and Grmek (2020), it is the primary vehicle of the curriculum and plays a dominant role in the teaching and learning process. It is an essential schoolbook and is considered crucial for teachers and students to achieve educational goals. The Ethiopian education system heavily relies on textbooks and teachers mainly depend on them to teach various subjects, including Civics and Ethical Education.

### ***Ethnicity and Textbook***

The processes of textbook writing and implementation should properly and constructively reflect issues of ethnicity. In Ethiopia, ethnic identity is conceptualized as in-group identification based on linguistic similarity or a constructed identity belonging to certain nations or nationalities, such as Afar, Amhara, Oromo, Tigray, and others. According to the school of thought of primordialism, ethnicity is about self-determination and involves a primordial and emotional attachment to fixed social characteristics, such as blood ties, race, language, region, and customs (Messay, 2019). Messay (2019) argues that identity politics is how elites from marginalized groups strive for state power by mobilizing people in the name of their oppressed ethnic identity. However, the school of instrumentalism contends that redrawing political borders based on self-determination neither advances democracy nor achieves the peaceful resolution of ethnic conflicts, which is evident in Ethiopia (Messay, 2019).

Due to the varied geographical formations of Ethiopia, it has been quite difficult to determine the distinctive number of ethnicities and languages in the country (Karbo, 2013). After 1991, ethnicity has become a major way of identifying oneself and has been a factor in various restructuring interventions in Ethiopia (Dawit & Haftu, 2012). The establishment of the federal system is currently based on ethnic identity. Our

experiences have shown that ethnicity had become a vital criterion in the assignment of higher governmental positions. Political parties based on ethnicity have grown rapidly and ethnic bounded associations have been gaining momentum. The use of ethnic criteria to implement a political goal explains the deep contradiction of ethnic movements in Ethiopia (Messay, 2019).

During the Imperial and Derg regimes of Ethiopia, attempts were made to localize the education system at the primary school level by changing the language of textbooks and the medium of instruction. However, indigenization of the education curricula from an ethnic group perspective was introduced in the post-1991 following the onset of a new political order known as ethnic federalism (Yishak & Gumbo, 2014). This political change has been exhibited in educational institutions as well, with regional anthems and flags becoming everyday features in many schools, regional colleges, and universities. Scholars argue that there are similarities between this ethno-federalist approach to education and the postmodernist way of thinking in that both make ethnic minorities the center of their moral discourse (Yishak & Gumbo, 2014; Girma, 2012).

### ***Nationalism and Textbook***

Ethiopian nationalistic identity is conceptualized to mean identification with the multination state of Ethiopia. Nationalism is a binding force that seeks to hold diverse groups together within a politically defined territory (Sabhlok, 2002). It is argued that in multiethnic countries, values and symbols that cross the boundary of ethnic groups and denote the practice and creation of nationalism over ethnicity are requisite. These values and symbols act as a means for integrating different ethnic groups into common nationhood and bringing national and ethnic identities onto a common platform. Common identities, based on primordial ascription or civic institutions, could be used in defining the national identity of the different groups in a multiethnic state (Sabhlok, 2002).

Since textbooks and school curricula convey facts and ideologies and follow political trends, it is possible to deduce that they can have a significant influence on what students know and how they think about others and themselves (Pingel, 1999). In a country with people from different ethnic groups, religions, and cultures, it is important for education to help them live and interact as one nation. Education for national unity emphasizes the factors that unite people and lays down divisive elements. The education system must strive to wipe out prejudices and enable learners to view and treat each other with mutual respect and understanding. Education needs to provide for the development of knowledge, skills, and attitudes that can instill the moral values essential for enabling children to grow into responsible, self-disciplined, and self-reliant individuals. The concern of all subjects should aim at rewarding virtues and condemning vices.

All textbooks should promote the concept of social responsibility and concern about the needs of others. This can be achieved through numerous opportunities for activities that foster social consciousness and service across social, economic, gender, and geographical divides. It can also be inculcated through the portrayal of positive characterization. Textbooks should emphasize values and practices that socialize the young towards respect for the elderly and the sharing of whatever resources are available.

### ***Religion and Textbook***

Religion is conceptualized as the spiritual belief of people (MoE, 2012). As noted by scholars in the area (e.g., McNamara, 2015; Swan, 2018), religion is the source of moral obligation and is a foundation for moral education. There are a lot of religions in the world as well as in Ethiopia among which Orthodox, Islam, Catholic, Adventism, and Protestantism are few to mention. It has significantly influenced man's history and literature (Barr, 1971). As one of the most sensitive areas of human life, religion has a vital influence on all of our behaviors and daily activities. Although

they cherish and love their religion, people are required to have respect for other religions. In Ethiopia, the two dominant religions Orthodox Christianity and Islam have coexisted in peace since the times of Prophet Mohammed (Karbo, 2013).

Religious education refers to the transmission of religious beliefs and values through the educational process (Freathy, nd). Religious education has been common in Ethiopia starting from the introduction of Christian and Islamic religions. The different kinds and sects of religious teachings have unique purposes, curricula, methodologies, and assessment mechanisms in their respective religious schools. The study of religion that is integrated into regular courses tends to show religion as one aspect of human life and objectivity should be maintained in the treatment of religion (Barr, 1971). Since religious education is used as a means of safeguarding public morality, secularism, materialism, and state worship should be countered by religious values (Freathy, nd). Whether or not religion is taught in schools, there is an imperative for educators to ensure that young people develop into citizens who can live together (Williams et al., 2008).

After the downfall of the Imperial government and the replacement of the military government in 1974, the state and religion were separated because of the socialist ideology adopted by the military government. Explicit religious education has been divorced from modern government school curricula. Following the military government's fall in the early 1990s, the existing ethnic-based federal government has also declared in the Constitution of Ethiopia that the government is committed to neutrality on the part of the state toward religious affairs; the state should neither favor nor disfavor any religious belief (Transitional Government of Ethiopia [TGE], 1995). The place of religious issues in the school curriculum and textbook preparation is important to develop an understanding of the equality of religion (Barr, 1971; Freathy, nd).

### ***Economic Levels and Textbook***

Until recently, agriculture was the most dominant economic sector, and the industrial sector is import-dependent in Ethiopia. Ethiopia's economy is highly vulnerable to exogenous shocks because of its dependence on primary commodities and rain-fed agriculture (Mwanakatwe & Barrow, 2010). Along with other things, this leads the country to be one of the poorest countries in the world. However, it has experienced strong economic growth in recent years and is trying to achieve a middle-level economy. According to Mwanakatwe and Barrow (2010), the government attaches great importance to fostering rapid economic growth with equity to reduce poverty.

In the Ethiopian context, there is no separate subject about economics education up to the lower secondary schools. Contents related to economic issues are integrated more with civics and ethical education in the form of industriousness, saving, self-reliance, and so on. There are also other subjects that implicitly or explicitly treat economic affairs. Teaching economy and economic systems as separate subjects is implemented starting from grade eleven. Yet, all textbooks are expected to demonstrate the economic realities of the nation in general and that of individuals in particular. This will help students conceptualize economic issues, understand the existence of variations in economic levels, and develop good habits of work.

### **Civics and Ethical Education in Ethiopia**

Following the introduction of modern education in Ethiopia, the Imperial government had been providing an independent school subject called *moral education*, which was equated with Christian religious education (Fenta, 2007; MoE, 2006). The purpose of moral education was to bring up citizens who have attachments with God and are loyal to the king (MoE, 2006). The contents were related to Christianity, the relationship of human beings with God, and different principles of Christian religion.

During the military government (1974-1991), religious education was removed and replaced by political education because of secularism. The purpose of political education was to prompt the growth of youth with a socialist outlook to make them politically conscious and competent citizens (MoE, 2004). According to MoE (2004), the contents and learning experiences were related to contemporary revolutionary processes, the issue of materialism, the negative effect of imperialism, principles of socialism, the national unity agenda, and so on. The current ethnic-based federal government has replaced the former political education with civic and ethical education, maintaining secularism in terms of religion. Although those moral lessons were predominantly influenced by religious teachings, citizens who had a chance to attend modern education were equipped with the knowledge and internalized the values of respect for social norms and moral standards of the time (Fenta, 2007).

As stated so far, school curricula in general and textbooks in particular are useful sources for understanding and developing identity in multiethnic countries like Ethiopia (Dawit & Haftu, 2012). This is true particularly in civics and ethical education as it intends to develop identities in the youth. As stated so far, Ethiopia has introduced Civic and Ethical Education to be offered as a separate subject starting from the primary to tertiary levels. The subject is organized into eleven chapters which include the democratic system, rule of law, equality, justice, patriotism, responsibility, industriousness, self-reliance, saving, active participation, and the pursuit of wisdom (MoE, 2006). This is true for all grade levels of secondary education, each chapter dealing with these core values with an increase in width and depth as grade levels increase.

## **Methods and Materials**

This study employed content analysis as a research method. The material used in the analysis was a grade-10 civic and ethical education textbook. The textbook has eleven chapters covered in 172 pages. The textbook was selected due to the content-related

inconsistencies the researchers observed. There was a map of Ethiopia (with its nine regions) presented in the former textbook demonstrating Benishangul-Gumuz and Tigray as adjacent regional states where the Amhara region was enclosed between them. Even though corrections were made later, this problem created complaints on the part of the Amhara people. This is one of the reasons which inspired the researchers to analyze the whole text. The textbook was published in the 2002 E.C. but immediately underwent revision in the 2004 E.C. due to serious inconsistencies encountered. This also initiated us to purposefully select and analyze the textbook.

Data was collected mainly using qualitative procedures. Concerning the qualitative data, topics, and sub-topics related to various identities were described and interpreted. The analysis involved the examination of phrases, sentences, and paragraphs. In addition, adjectives and descriptions that connote religious, ethnic, and national identities as well as economic issues were identified. There was also some quantitative data which were collected by considering all of the pictures (94 in number) throughout the textbook.

The analysis consisted of two parts. The first part was an analysis of the qualitative data. Topics related to conceptualizations of ethnicity, religion, nationality, and economic levels were noted and interpreted. In doing so, every page of the textbook was examined. The second part comprised of quantitative data obtained through counting all pictures. The quantitative data were analyzed based on frequency counts of the pictures and corresponding percentages. In this regard, the investigators were able to manage pictorial representations and easily identify whether a given picture reflects religious, ethnic, national, or economic issues.

### **Trustworthiness**

Concerning ensuring trustworthiness, the investigators exerted effort to present the findings drawn from the original data and make interpretations. Attempts have been made to produce valid data and credible findings through detailed accounts of texts and pictures. The researchers were also trying to be more transparent in reporting the

findings. Furthermore, two colleagues (from the Department of Civics and Ethical Studies at Bahir Dar University) have provided their feedback on the paper. In addition to the specific strategies mentioned here, we also believe that our professional identities as well as related long-aged experiences in the world of teaching may contribute to the quality of the research.

## **Results and Discussions**

This section deals with the organization and interpretation of data taken from the textbook under study. Description of direct quotes and the subsequent interpretation are presented regarding the representation of ethnicity, nationalism, religion, and economic issues in the civics and ethical education textbook of grade ten.

### ***Representation of Ethnicity***

The presentation of ethnic issues started from the cover page of the textbook. On the outer part of the later cover page, the flags of the nine regional states are displayed surrounding the national flag. In the inner part of the same cover page, the pictures of these flags are posted with descriptions to show belongingness. When it comes to the main body, the first subtopic of chapter one (principles and values of a democratic system) touches on ethnic identity issues when it demonstrates the principles that govern elections. One article (Article 38, sub-article) which is directly quoted from the Constitution on page 4 states “*Every Ethiopian national, without any discrimination based on color, race, nation, nationality, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion or other status, has the following rights....*”. *This reveals that everyone has the right to vote without discrimination based on ethnicity.*

Following this right of election, the issues of human and democratic rights are discussed to inform the students about the possession of such rights to every citizen. Students are also noted about one’s obligation together with their human and democratic rights on page 12. The textbook stressed that we are obliged to respect the rights of nations, nationalities, and peoples of Ethiopia to promote their identities in

this respect. It concludes the issue of rights and obligations by displaying a scenario (p. 13) about stereotyping among ethnic groups followed by an activity that enables students to discuss the negative consequences of stereotyping in terms of ethnicity. This indicates that, among others, ethnic identities are given a significant place.

In lesson four of the textbook, we found a subtopic dealing with *tolerance* of diversity. The textbook tries to capture students` attention through the following objectives which reads, “By the end of this lesson, you should be able to: *explain the importance of tolerance of diversity; describe the implications of tolerance of diversity for a multicultural country...., and be tolerant of cultural differences*” (p.16)

The objectives here indicate ethnic identity as one of the components of diversity that should be inculcated by students. In its readings, the textbook defines or describes diversity and tolerance in terms of the different ethnic groups in the country. Here, students are required to remember the inevitability of diversity and the subsequent demand for tolerance of ethnic differences through the following remark (p.19).

*In Ethiopia, there are over eighty cultural groups with different languages and ways of life. Diversity is valuable and tolerance is a way to create peace and promote development. Ethiopia is the sum of its different nations, nationalities, and peoples and their ways of life....*

In this sense, the textbook attempts to teach the quest for living together in harmony through the development of mindful, respectful, and tolerant personalities among different ethnic identities in Ethiopia.

The issues of ethnicity and ethnic identity are emphasized in the discussion of state formation in Ethiopia. After briefing the historical trends of state formation, the textbook elaborates on the nature of the current federal system (pp. 20-26). In discussing the state of Ethiopia, failure stories of the past and success stories of the present are highly emphasized. The readings, pictures, and case studies show that the Haile Sellassie and Derg regimes were repressive of ethnic identities which gave way to the birth of the Ethiopian People's Revolution Democratic Front [EPRDF]

characterized by appreciation of such identities. There is a detailed discussion on the nature of the unitary system vis-à-vis the present federal system of government. The nine ethnic-based regional states are listed in the form of text and a map of the country showing the states (p.24).

These ethnic federal states have specific boundaries and are autonomous to administer themselves according to their unique values. Though it was modified in the second edition made after two years, it is surprising that the map of Ethiopia in the first publication was presented with wrong boundaries in some regions. Benishangul-Gumuz and Tigray states were made to be next-door neighbors ignoring the real map of the Amhara region. From this, it is safe to conclude that there was a tendency to deny Amhara ethnic groups in that specific area.

The first unit is closed by giving exercises to students about the issues of diversity, tolerance, rights/obligations, and ethnic federalism. In general, the textbook in this chapter has a high tendency to inculcate ethnic values and identities. Moreover, there is an attempt to condemn the past regimes by promoting the present as successful in bringing “solidarity” through ethnic federalism. Thus, it is possible to conclude from this chapter (*Building Democratic System*) that ethnic identity is emphasized over national identity.

When we come to the second chapter, the rule of law, and ethnic issues have a significant place in readings and illustrations. In discussing the nature and practice of the rule of law, past governments are highly criticized for violating the rights of ethnic groups. Some of the characteristics of the constitutions during the imperial and military states are presented (pp. 34-44) to show the absence of the rule of law and how the rights of ethnicity were denied. This is clearly stated on (p.42), “Unlike the past constitutions, the 1995 Constitution gives the political power to the nations, nationalities and peoples of Ethiopia.” The textbook tries to promote the role of ethnic groups as a basis for the present constitution. It is also stated that representatives from nations, nationalities, and peoples of Ethiopia have come together and established the

Constitution (p.36). From this chapter, it is again possible to conclude that the textbook is promoting the present government at the expense of the past. This shows that the current political figures are appreciated in terms of ethnic issues. This further signifies that ethnic identities are highly recognized in this chapter.

The third unit is about equality within diversity and the importance of equality in promoting peace, stability, and development. If there is equality, by implication there are diversified groups meant for it among which ethnicity is one of the dominant dimensions. The unit focuses on the equality of cultures in its readings, pictures, scenarios, and exercises. The discussion starts by briefing the concepts of equality and manifestations of inequalities based on race in other parts of the world like USA. Together with others, the textbook tries to note the absence of equality in the past regimes through such sentences (p.49) “..... inequality prevailed among nations, nationalities and peoples of Ethiopia in the period of previous governments.” After criticizing the past regimes, a paragraph on the same page constitutes ideas like,

*Now people are represented both through the regional and federal governments. At the federal level, each nation, nationality, and people is represented in the House of Peoples' Representatives and the House of the Federation.... Because the Constitution guarantees the rights of the nations, nationalities, and peoples, they have started to enjoy their political, economic, and social rights as citizens of Ethiopia.*

From the presentation above, the Constitution highly favors ethnicity as a base for peoples' representation in the House of Peoples' Representatives and the House of Federation. In this regard, Articles 54 (3) and 61 (1 & 2) of the Constitution are quoted on page 50 to show emphasis on ethnicity as the foundation for representation in the two houses. On the same page, students are also given exercises that enable them to identify which article of the Constitution gives minority nationalities, to discuss how people are represented in the two houses, and to reflect on their view on the benefits of such kind of representation.

In dealing with equality of culture (pp.56-58), it is boldly noted that language is an important element of culture. “All languages are equal and important” (p.56). When we are talking about language, it is clear that we are talking about ethnic culture in the context of our country. “There are around 80 different cultural groups who have different languages, styles of clothes and dances” (p.57). Since ethnic identity is a fundamental ideology of the country, most of the features are manifested in the language as another pillar of ethnic diversity. Finally, the chapter concludes by reminding the presence of ethnic diversity thereby promoting equality of ethnic cultures if we want to live together in peace.

In the discussion of chapter four of the textbook, justice *and* ethnicity seems central to conceptualizing justice and visualizing the practice of justice systems in the country. The chapter introduces the prevalence of injustice practices in terms of social services and benefits in different countries including Ethiopia. The textbook tries to show the impacts of lack of justice which results in civil wars and instability in Ethiopia. A paragraph (p.63) indicates that the past governments controlled and exercised power without considering the will of the people, thereby leading to civil war.

*It did not recognize the rights and equality of the nations, nationalities, and peoples of Ethiopia. It violated the rights of individuals and groups in the name of unity. It denied the citizens the right to use their languages in schools and the law courts, to elect their representatives, and to rule themselves. The people of Ethiopia rose and fought against the Derg.*

As we can see in the above vignette, Derg was criticized for denying the rights of ethnic groups by the name of unity. According to the textbook, the main cause of civil war against the military government was the unfair treatment of ethnic groups. This is also supported by a portion from a paragraph as follows (p.64):

*Treating all citizens equally creates a peaceful way of life. It is only in peaceful situations that democracy can be consolidated, and the lives of people improved. This did not happen in Ethiopia in the past. The nations, nationalities, and peoples of Ethiopia were not permitted to administer themselves....*

Thus, the issue of justice is conceptualized mainly as fair treatment of ethnic nationalities. A case study presented (p.65) about the installation of mobile schools in the Afar pastoralist community depicts that the present government is committed to being fair in treating nations and nationalities. Concerning the judiciary system, students are noted to be aware that regional states have their supreme courts responsible for the settlement of regional issues and cases (p.70). This shows that the textbook is intended to preach the ethno-political ideology of the present government, which further indicates a narrative of ethnic inequalities in the past.

In dealing with patriotism and responsibility, ethnic issues are given an important place. In the discussion of requirements to increase patriotism, respect, and tolerance of diversity are taken to be central. According to the textbook, unequal treatment was common in our country in the past. It adds that some groups of people were treated much better than others. Some had the right to read and write in their language, but many others did not. To justify this, we can see portions of a different paragraph which reads ‘‘Diversity was not appreciated in the past. Governments tried to maintain unity without recognizing the equality of the people. They did not care about promoting equality among groups with different languages, religion and other cultural traits’’ (p.77):

Accordingly, students and readers of the textbook are remarked to understand that Ethiopian history is the history of its nations, nationalities and peoples. People will become patriotic when they feel that they are equal in every respect. This is more justified by the following paragraph:

*Citizens develop patriotic feelings about their country when they all feel equal. If they are denied their rights or believe their views are being ignored and/or are being treated unfairly, they will feel negative towards their country. .... People who are denied their rights cannot develop a sense of patriotism and a group of people who are badly treated may decide to fight for equality and their rights. (p.76)*

Ethnicity is also addressed indirectly in the form of endurance and poverty reduction. A photograph of Tirunesh (p.75) and a picture of the farmer (p.84) from the Oromya region are presented as signs of patriotism. Even though they are displayed to teach the common good as national values, one can also think that the two pictures have the potential to manifest representation of ethnic issues.

The treatment of responsibility in the sixth chapter starts with a picture of people from an ethnic group. It then reminds us that one of the duties of a responsible citizen is to develop an attitude of tolerance to live in peace with others. “When you perform your civic duties well, you can handle ethnic, linguistic, and religious diversities properly” (p.91). In the discussion of responsibilities for the protection of natural resources and cultural heritage of the country, there are ethnic elements in the form of pictures, case scenarios, and exercises. A case study on ‘Friends of the Earth’ Club in Amhara, Oromya, and Tigray regions (p.102); an exercise on cultural heritages and tourism center, “Tiya stone monument in SNNP”; and a case study on Aba Jeffar’s palace in Oromya have potential to reflect ethnicity although they have greater potential to teach sense of nationalism.

In addition to explicit discussion, different pictures and in-text readings also show the existence of ethnic issues integrated with different topics and subtopics. From the total of 94 pictures throughout the textbook, there are about 21 pictures that manifest ethnic representations. This covers 22.34% of the total number of pictures and photographs displayed.

### ***Representation of Nationality/Ethiopianism***

The attempt to inculcate national values and develop a sense of national identity starts from the cover pages of the textbook. The outer part of the first cover page contains the map of Ethiopia and its flag while the inner part demonstrates the national anthem written in Amharic version. In much of the discussions of ethnicity in the main body, national issues are touched in association with positive and negative connotations.

Under the topic, Building Democratic System, the first sub-topic (pp. 2-7) deals with the principles and values of the democratic system implemented in Ethiopia. The textbook tries to teach such binding values by demonstrating the practices of Ethiopia in relation to public participation; universal suffrage; fair, free, and periodic elections; majority rule and minority rights; transparency and accountability; and multiparty competition. In the discussion of rights (pp. 8-11), Ethiopian nationality is addressed in the form of the Constitution which governs the behavior of all citizens and ethnic groups in relation to exercising human and democratic rights.

Followed by the detailed discussion of rights, the issue of obligation is presented with texts and illustrations. Even though the emphasis is on differences, the textbook states some articles from the Constitution and tries to remind students to identify their obligations as citizens of the country. For example, what is stated on (p.12) of the textbook “You have the constitutional obligation to respect the human rights of ethnic, religious or linguistic minorities showcases this. One important sentence written on page 13 reads, “Do not forget that the purpose of learning about your rights and obligations. It is not only to study them but to put them into practice.”

There is a separate subtopic about tolerance which tries to show the presence of diversities to be acknowledged and respected to secure Ethiopian nationality and related identities. Tolerating the culture of others seems to be presented to remind the issue of nationalism. This is exemplified by ideas in different paragraphs (pp. 16-17):

*In Ethiopia, over eighty cultural groups have different languages and ways of life. Although they have different cultures, they have only one homeland that they share in common with others. ....Ethiopia has to be a comfortable place for them to live in with respect and dignity. This is achieved when citizens give the respect that others deserve. In this way, Ethiopians can develop shared values and a common destiny. As a citizen, you have to be able to see that all cultures are equal.... Ethiopia is the total of its different nations, nationalities, and peoples and their ways of life... Think about Ethiopia as a human body. A person remains healthy and active when all his body parts function in a healthy way.....*

The extract here indicates how system theory also works on nationalism. Like that of a human body system, a nation is defined in terms of the functions of its interdependent identity groups. The issue of Ethiopian nationality is also manifested in a case study and the exercise provided sum up the concept of tolerance. Students are required to consolidate the idea of diversity and related tolerance through a case study presentation (p.17) on how culture meets culture by mentioning different kinds of cultures from different areas of the country. In addition, a case study about Mahatma Gandhi (p.18) is presented to show the power of tolerance to live in peace.

*A subtopic entitled State Formation in Ethiopia begins with introducing the objectives students are expected to achieve regarding the historical and present features of states in the country. A sense of national identity seems to be reflected through the pictures of Tewodros-II, Yohannes-IV, Minilik-II, and Haile Sellassie-I in an attempt to teach the history of Ethiopian national state formation. The different state formations and the struggle of Ethiopian people against autocratic governments are discussed in contrast with the present one. The textbook disregards the past efforts and appreciates EPRDF as it started “a true Ethiopian nationality ever. From such kind of attempts to teach a sense of nationalism, it is possible to argue that the textbook tends to advocate the efforts of the present political party in the name of shared national values.*

In dealing with the rule of law, the values of Ethiopian nationality are reflected in the form of constitutional issues which are repeatedly mentioned in contrast with the past ones. “Rule of law evolves and governs relations between individuals, groups, and institutions” (p.39). As we have seen in the discussion of ethnicity above, the Orthodox Church was considered as a source of the constitution and the power to the king which is criticized by the textbook as autocratic. This by default will increase the likelihood of the Church being distanced. By the same token, the imperial and military governments are portrayed (in text as well as in pictures) as typical examples of breaking the rule of law. For instance, the discussion of the rule of law reflects the following ideas: “*The concept of rule of law in Ethiopian history was unthinkable. Up to 1991, it was ruled by kings and the rule of the authoritarian and the few*” (p.40. Unlike the past constitutions, the 1995 Constitution gives political power to the nations, nationalities, and peoples of Ethiopia (p.42). There have been many instances where the governments of Ethiopia used military power to violate human rights.... During the Derg regime

*in Ethiopia in the late 1970s, such summary executions happened. .... there was mass killing, torturing, and imprisonment of people who were suspected of being 'anti-revolutionary'. Dead bodies were seen scattered on the streets. These killings continued without due process of law. People were killed, as mentioned above, just because they were suspected of having a different opinion. (p.43)*

The textbook further presented a case study that shows the story of a poor woman who was a red terror victim in Addis Ababa (p.43). The main theme of this story is that the woman had a son and a daughter without a father; however, the then government snatched and killed them when they were in grade 12. The texts extracted above in the discussion of the rule of law generally reflect negative connotations which can be interpreted in many ways. In such teachings, it is difficult to develop the required Ethiopian nationality.

In treating the concept and practice of equality (pp. 47-59), the methods and strategies used to teach Ethiopian nationality are not as constructive. The discussion shows more of the history of inequalities. In summarizing the unit (p.59), there is a paragraph in which we read, "Inequality based on sex, family and cultural background common in Ethiopia. Nations, nationalities, and peoples did not have equal political participation in the period of the previous governments." This indicates that there was oppression of one ethnic group over the other. This kind of approach leads students to center around their ethnic identity and creates stereotyping rather than a sense of concern for Ethiopian nationalism.

The next chapter on justice starts its discussion by highlighting the subtopics and a picture of courts. As it has been discussed in ethnicity, justice is conceptualized as fair treatment of groups and individuals. The chapter introduces the prevalence of injustice practices in terms of social services and benefits in Ethiopia. The textbook tries to develop a sense of Ethiopian nationality by showing how injustice practices have resulted in civil wars and instability in Ethiopia. The organizations and functions of

the judiciary of the present government are portrayed in the form of text, case study, and activity, by contrasting with that of the imperial and military periods.

Ethiopian identity is also portrayed in the form of patriotism. Patriotism is conceptualized as respect for people of different nations and nationalities, tolerance for diversity and differences, contributions to the nation, concern for national resources, and commitment to one's work. There is a separate topic that deals with the concept of patriotism, the requirements of increasing patriotism, and areas of patriotic activities. In its highlight section, the chapter portrays the picture of Tirunesh Dibaba to exemplify her as a sign of patriotism in winning an Olympic gold medal.

A subtopic on the requirements to develop a feeling of patriotism tries to remind students to be tolerant of diversity and respect the national flag through objectives, texts, case study narrations, and activity engagements. It stressfully notes that all people should respect diversity and equality of peoples to develop a sense of patriotism. However, the way of teaching patriotism seems less constructive in developing a sense of Ethiopian nationality among all citizens. If we read the textbook (p. 76), we get the following ideas in different paragraphs:

*Unequal treatment was common in our country in the past. .... Some groups of people were treated much better than others. Some had the right to read and write in their language, but many others did not. People who are denied their rights cannot develop a sense of patriotism and a group of people who are badly treated may decide to fight for equality and their rights.*

*.... Diversity was not appreciated in the past. Governments tried to maintain unity without recognizing the equality of the people. They did not care about promoting equality among groups with different languages, religions, and other cultural traits.*

In discussing patriotism from the perspective of common goods, students are introduced to what to do and not to do as a patriot. The idea "Patriotic citizens have many duties including keeping state secrets, fighting against terrorism, and

condemning nationalistic chauvinism" (p.82) can be cited as an instance. The dangers of terrorism, corruption, and extreme nationalism are portrayed through case studies and corresponding activities performed by students.

In the next subtopic of the textbook, there are other aspects of patriotism which include engagement in poverty reduction and voluntarism. After a brief presentation of success stories in defeating external enemies and failure stories in internal wars, the textbook tries to explain the problem of such war culture. The extract on page 84 of the textbook gives such confirmations. It states: "We have to transform this war culture to a culture of working together. We need to do this to gain victory over poverty and backwardness and to be proud of being Ethiopians". In this regard, the next paragraphs and case studies try to promote the achievements of the current government in mobilizing the people to fight against poverty. Towards the end of the chapter, the issue of voluntarism is elaborated through exemplars that are known for giving free services to the public.

A sign of Ethiopian nationality is boldly seen in the discussion of responsibility, which is situated in the sixth chapter of the textbook. In its introduction (p.90), the keywords and concepts listed demonstrate the Ethiopian nationality affairs. In the first subtopic, students are introduced that every citizen has civic duties. It reads (p.91), "*Civic duties are the responsibilities of all citizens. Civil duties are part of the constitutional responsibilities of citizens of a country.*" It is also stressed in this topic that previous lessons such as democracy, rule of law, equality, justice, and patriotism are helpful to expand knowledge and practice responsibility in national and local contexts. There exists a tendency to treat responsibility in association with national unity.

The second subtopic deals with taking the consequences of one's action to remind the students to develop a sense of personal, social, and moral responsibilities. *Personal responsibility is meant to be "managing oneself and caring for others" (p.94), social responsibility means "thinking about the well-being of society" (p.95), and moral*

---

*responsibility defined to be “behaving in ways that conform to the social norms”* (p.95). From this, it is possible to infer that the content of Ethiopian nationality is more likely to be reflected.

More specifically, there is a separate subtopic that explicitly discusses the issue of national responsibility. The texts, pictures, and case narratives from pages 98 to 105 portray the various national responsibilities of any citizen having adequate elaborations and illustrations. As a citizen, students are taught to respect the Constitution and other laws of the country, to defend the motherland in times of war and invasion, to resolve conflicts peacefully, to be hard working and build national image, doing what they can for the country. They are also introduced to develop responsibilities for the protection of natural resources and cultural heritage of the country. The danger of deforestation and associated drought; the benefits of reforestation and wildlife; the importance of rivers, waterfalls, and lakes; the care for historical places from Christian and Islamic religions; and palaces of the 19<sup>th</sup> century are presented through explanations as typical examples. These responsibility-related texts are important manifestations dealing with national concerns.

A separate chapter also manifests the issue of nationalism entitled community participation. According to the title, many Ethiopian nationality content encourages readers to be concerned and care for others. The importance of one's engagement in social participation and improving the quality of a community's life are presented in texts and case studies. The textbook lists the different forms of voluntary social participation which include *“registered charities, environment protection associations, women's organizations, youth organizations, professional associations and the like”* (p.149). Civic society in democratic countries is conceptualized in relation to the role it plays in promoting member's interests and holding governmental accountability to the public. In conclusion, students are informed that different types of civic societies are established in different communities for diverse purposes.

Therefore, it is possible to draw that citizenship, and nationalistic issues are addressed in the discussion of community participation.

The analysis in this section suggests that nationalism, national unity, and love for the country are given important places. Attempts have been made to address Ethiopian identity and nationality in the form of patriotism, national flag, national anthem, diversity issues, tolerance, commitment to serve the country, and the like. Apart from in-text readings, different pictures also show the existence of nationality concerns, integrated with different topics and subtopics. From the total of 94 pictures throughout the textbook, there are about 28 pictures that manifest nationalism representations. This covers 29.8% of the total number of pictures and photographs displayed, which seems quite greater than ethnic representations.

### ***Representation of Religion***

As we discussed so far, religious education is more or less connected with moral values and ethical education. The evaluation of grade-10 civics and ethical education book's religious representation is slightly portrayed throughout. To begin with the *rule of law*, religious issues are addressed as they have their divine law. The extract taken from page 38 of the textbook reveals that:

*In religions, there is a belief called divine law. Such a law is considered to be the outcome of divine power. This belief considers that everything else in this world and the universe is created by a supernatural force. To those who believe in divine law, this force has given the universe a reason for its existence.*

Historically, the textbook remarks that the constitutional laws of the imperial government and the source of power to the king was the Orthodox Church. The textbook treats this idea, “... As a result, all rules and regulations of the church were issued by the Emperor, and the election and appointment of the patriarch were to be approved by him” (p.34). There is consensus among scholars that both the Orthodox Church and the monarchy were fostering nationalism (Karbo, 2013).

The place of religion in some readings seems unhelpful in encouraging the development of religious values among all students. For instance, Christian religion is presented in the discussion of the source of the power of the kings in the past regimes. Some students may not learn constructive ideas and may develop even stereotyped behavior when they read a paragraph containing the following text:

*It was clearly stated in both Constitutions that the king's power was of divine origin, and he belonged to the Solomonic dynasty, the lion of Judah, which mythically traced back its origins to King Solomon of Jerusalem and Queen Sheba of Ethiopia. This myth brought the Emperors into a blood relationship with Christ in the house of David. Thus, Ethiopian Emperors had been regarded as having mystic, semi-divine powers, guaranteeing the wholeness and prosperity of their people. (p.40)*

In these kinds of texts, people from other religions would feel humiliated. In such a scenario, there will be the likely development of a fractured society. Furthermore, some religious views are condemned to harm the habit of saving and limit family size. A case study on page 136 and the following portions of readings are important examples in this respect:

*..... Some people say that they do not need to think about the future as God will take care of the future. In Ethiopia, some people think like that. But this is not right. You have to do your best to get what you want before saying that God will take care of it. People who believe God will take care of the future also believe that they should not limit the number of children they have. They say that God will take care of their children. Because of this, they have lots of children....*

On the other hand, students are introduced to the issues of religion, religious identities, equality of religion, and related tolerance in constructive ways. Under the sub-topic of “*Equality of Religion*” that reads pages 56 to 57, the textbook introduced that religion is the spiritual belief of people, and students are noted to remember that people cherish and love their religion. The textbook continues to expand students` awareness about the presence of various religions in the world and Ethiopia as well. It remarks Ethiopia

as a land of religious diversity and presents Article 27 sub-article 1 from the Constitution, "*Everyone has the right to freedom of ... religion....*"

Under this sub-topic, a case study on religious extremism and its consequences on other religions is portrayed to warn the learners. This is followed by an activity that invites students to conduct group discussions regarding the right to choose a religion, religious tolerance, and conflict resolution mechanisms related to religious controversies. Finally, students are informed to respect the religions of other people and appreciate different religious events and celebrations. Furthermore, in the discussion of responsibilities for the protection of natural resources and cultural heritage of the country, there are religious elements in the form of pictures, case scenarios, and exercises. Pictures of Sof-Omar Cave and Debre Damo Church (p.103) and a case study on the theft of church manuscripts (p.104) could be important manifestations of the textbook to reflect religious issues.

The result generally suggests that religion and religious issues are treated yet in less constructive ways. It is also safe to conclude that the issues of religion are not given an important place in the textbook. In addition to explicit discussions as texts and case studies, few pictures show the existence of religious issues. From the total of 94 pictures throughout the textbook, there are only 3 pictures that manifest religious representations. This covers 3.2% of the total number of pictures and photographs displayed. Accordingly, many core values and teachings that enable students to develop humility, honesty, fear of God, and so on seem to be missing because of secularism in education. However, it is possible to argue that many religious contents that can cross different religious principles can be included.

### ***Representation of Economic level***

The separate chapter on industriousness tries to deal with the rewards and personal well-being, incurred from hard work and good work habits through the presentation of facts and realities showing our economic levels. Photographs of a shoeshine boy,

daily physical laborers, and a plowing farmer are some examples treated under the subtopic of work and wellbeing. The case studies and reading texts also indicate that all types of work are equally important and should be respected at the economic level. Accordingly, students are advised to choose an appropriate economic system by considering the economic potential of our country and the global economic trends. Therefore, it is possible to generalize that the discussion of industriousness has explicitly portrayed both personal and national economic levels.

In dealing with the 10<sup>th</sup> chapter, the textbook has given attention to the concept of saving, traditional practices that affect saving, and related economic activities. The conceptualization of saving begins with highlighting keywords and demonstrating the National Bank of Ethiopia in a picture followed by a subtopic treating the traditional practices that affect saving habits in Ethiopia. The in-text readings and a case study narration on page 136 clearly show that most of the people of our country believe in God to determine their future destiny. Such attitudes make these people not limit their children, not practice saving, and not get rid of poverty. Accordingly, the textbook tries to advise students to develop a culture of saving and avoiding extravagant practices that bring progressive economic transformation. From the discussion of saving, it is possible to infer that the lower economic levels, the move towards higher economic levels, and associated factors are adequately treated.

In addition to the explicit discussion of our economic levels, we can also find significant representations integrated with different value contents throughout the textbook. Economic levels at individual, regional, and national levels are observed in the form of narrations and pictures. For instance, the discussion of protection of natural resources and cultural heritages, patriotism in poverty reduction, and other units indicate the level of our economy.

The subtopic on responsibilities in the protection of natural resources and cultural heritages (pp.100-105) indicates the representation of forests, Barro River, Awash fall, Lake Tana, mountain Nyala, Tiya stone monument, Sof-Omar cave, Debre Damo, Geez manuscript, Aba Jeffar palace, etc. in pictures, case studies, and activities. This shows the country's economic level in terms of tourism. In association with patriotism, the textbook reminds students to note that poverty is our common enemy which citizens should fight against. This is exemplified in the following paragraphs (p.83);

*Our country is one of the poorest countries in the world. Many people do not get three meals a day. Some people still depend upon food aid to survive in times of drought and famine. We need to fight against poverty, famine, and backwardness which negatively affect the image of our country..... It is our duty to work hard to eradicate poverty and change the image of our country.*

The above extract suggests that poverty reduction is one of our patriotic activities in which citizens should participate. In this regard, a successful and model farmer is presented (p.84) in the form of case narratives to initiate others to be engaged in such kind of economic transformation.

In conclusion, the analysis suggests that the textbook has treated economic issues both at national and individual levels. The countries and individuals' economic level is demonstrated directly and indirectly integrated with different core values in the textbook. Among the eleven chapters, four of them explicitly deal with economic levels and related issues. Value contents such as industriousness, self-reliance, and saving seem to reflect ways of personal life and related economic issues. From the total of 94 pictures throughout the textbook, there are about 27 pictures that manifest economic representations. This covers 28.7% of the total number of pictures and photographs displayed.

## Summary, Conclusions, and Implications

When we summarize the overall coverage of the textbook, the table below shows that there are 94 pictures each representing the different variables under treatment. Ethnicity, Ethiopian nationality, religion, and economic levels cover 22.3%, 29.8%, 3.2%, and 28.7% respectively.

*Table 2: Pictorial representation of ethnicity, nationalism, religion, and economic levels*

<b>Variables</b>	<b>Frequency</b>	<b>Percentage</b>
Ethnic issues	21	22.3
Ethiopian nationality issues	28	29.8
Religious issues	3	3.2
Economic status issues	27	28.7
Others	15	15.96
<b>Total number of pictures</b>	<b>94</b>	<b>100</b>

This quantitative figure indicates that the Ethiopian nationality is given a more significant place over ethnic nationality. The economic level is adequately represented in the picture taking the second rank of the total pictures in the textbook. On the other hand, religious issues cover only 3.2% showing that inadequate place is given to religious concerns.

Even though the quantitative figure shows that more coverage is given to Ethiopian nationality, the qualitative analysis in this research generally suggests that there seems a tendency to encourage students to have strong feelings about ethnic values and underscore ethnic identity as the core value for human beings. Ethnic identity issues have been more frequently raised and strongly promoted in the form of ethnic federalism, ethnic values and symbols, and ethnocultural identities. The textbook is more likely to deepen students' ethnic identity over their national identity. There was similar finding in the upper primary grade social studies textbook conducted by Dawit and Haftu (2012). They found that the social studies textbook promotes ethnic federalism. This indicates that nationalism as a perspective is appearing to be

marginalized. Therefore, concerned bodies are required to have thoughtful deliberations on how to make the balance between national identity and ethnic identities in our multicultural country.

Of course, there appears to be an adequate reference to national identity in terms of sharing similar values, symbols, and historical monuments. However, the method of inculcating Ethiopian identity is not as constructive. There are biased presentations of concepts that foster stereotyping and hostility (with grievance) about past governments. The textbook generally reinforces ethnic values and behaviors to enable students to learn much about the past inequalities among various groups. In this regard, the past governments have been highly condemned, and the present one is highly rated as successful. According to Gachukia and Chung (2005), negative self-images may be formed or reinforced if the textbook provides such a kind of negative role model. If we want a textbook to remain valuable for years, one of the pitfalls to avoid is the inclusion of current political figures in the textbook (Gachukia & Fay, 2005). So, textbook writers are advised not to include living political figures while writing textbooks of any educational level.

Though at a minimal level, religious issues are entertained in the curriculum without giving much attention to their deeper meanings. According to the researchers' perception, religion and religious issues are not given an important place in the textbook. Some presentations of the Orthodox Church and the monarchy are given negative connotations. The researchers believe that it will be more effective in developing a proper personality if this subject gives attention to the common principles of different religions. Therefore, the researchers advise textbook writers to endorse religious values that cross different religious sects while writing textbooks at different levels of the educational system.

Economic issues are demonstrated directly and indirectly by integrating them with different cardinal values discussed in the subject. The textbook reminds students to note the existence of different forms and levels of the economic system in Ethiopia. Analyses from pictures and in-text readings demonstrated the existence of absolute poverty and the individual and national level movements exerted to reduce such poverty. Therefore, it is possible to argue that the textbook has the potential to teach students about the real image of the different economic levels in the country.

Last, the attempt made to represent ethnicity, nationality, religion, and economic levels in the textbook has positive implications for social climate change and nation-building. Yet, much effort is required to improve the curriculum in a way that enables it to reverse the current social situation. Policymakers, curriculum designers, and textbook writers are demanded to reconsider the issues of national identity and maintain national unity in dealing with ethnicity, religion, and economic concerns.

### **Limitations**

The study did not include the perspectives of teachers and students, which would have provided a more comprehensive view of the textbook analysis in question. Additionally, the generalizability of the findings is limited to a specific textbook and may not accurately reflect the other textbooks used for civics and ethical education in the school system. Nevertheless, efforts were made to ensure the trustworthiness of the analysis of the specific textbook content.

### **Conflicts of interests**

The researchers reported that there is no conflict of interest in this publication.

---

## References

Barr, D.L. (1971). *Religion in curriculum: Association of supervision and curriculum development*, USA

Dawit, M., & Haftu, H. (2012). Civic and ethical education and history textbooks' portrayal of group identity and students' perspectives on their contributions in shaping identity. *The Ethiopian Journal of Education*, 32(2)

Fenta, A. (2007). Professional ethics in quagmire, *Bi-Annual Bulletin of Teacher Education*, 1(2), 4 – 5.

Freathy, R. (nd). The Triumph of Religious Education for Citizenship in English Schools.

Gachukia, E., & Chung, F. (2005). *The Textbook Writer's Manual*. UNESCO-IICBA, Economic Commission for Africa, Addis Ababa.

Girma, A. (2006). The Implementation of Grade 8 Civic and Ethical Education: *The Case of Addis Ababa City Administration*, MA-Thesis, AAU (unpublished).

Karbo, T. (2013). Religion and social cohesion in Ethiopia. *International Journal of Peace and Development Studies*, 4(3), 43-52

Maclare, J. & Taylor, C. (2011). Secularism and Freedom of Conscience. Harvard University.

McNamara, V. (2015). *Religion and morality*. University of Southern California, <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.1177>

Messay, K. (2019). The Nature and Challenges of Ethnicity: The Case of Ethiopia, *Paper presented at Ethiopia Forum: Challenges and Prospects for Constitutional Democracy in Ethiopia, March 22-24, Michigan*

Melesse, S. (2015). The contribution of teacher education program curricula for prospective teachers' multicultural competence. PhD Dissertation, AAU, (Unpublished)

Mithans, M., & Grmek, M.I. (2020). *The Use of Textbooks in the Teaching-Learning Process*. Research Gate

MoE. (2013). *Secondary School Curriculum and Instruction*. A Teaching Module for PGDT, unpublished

MoE. (2012). *Civics and Ethical Education: Grade 10 student textbook*. Addis Ababa: Laxmi Publications

MoE. (2006). *Civics and ethical education program*. Addis Ababa: Educational Materials Production and Distribution

MoE. (2004). Guideline for citizens` responsibilities in the inculcation of civics and ethical education. Ethio Tikur Abay Press.

Mulualem, Y., Fitsumbirhan, T., & Fitsum, A. (2017). The Role of Civic and Ethical Education in the Development of Students' Behavior in Tahtay Koraro Wereda: *International Journal of Sustainable Development Research* 3(6):77-84

Mulugeta, Y., Animaw, T., Desalegn, B., & Belay, T. (2011). Evaluative research on the effectiveness of civic and ethical education program: With particular reference to schools in East Gojjam administrative zone, *Journal of Educational Research*, 1(1), 27- 56.

Mwanakatwe, P. & Barrow, L. (2010). Ethiopia's Economic Growth Performance: Current Situation and Challenges. *Economic Brief*, 1(5)

Pingel, F. (1999). *UNESCO guidebook on textbook research and textbook revision*. UNESCO, Paris.

Sabhlok, S.G. (2002). Nationalism and ethnicity and the nation-state in South Asia, *Nationalism, and Ethnic Politics*, 8(3):24-42

Swan, T. (2018). *What is the relationship between religion and morality?*  
<https://owlcation.com/humanities/What-is-the-relationship-between-religion-and-morality>

Transitional Government of Ethiopia. (1995). The Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia Constitution, Negarit Gazeta

Williams, K., Hinge, H., & Persson, B.L. (2008). *Religion and citizenship education in Europe*. London: Socrates publishing

Yishak, D.M., & Gumbo, M.T. (2014). The Marginalization of the Gamo Ethnic Group through Curriculum Planning and Processes in Ethiopia. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences*, 5(10).